

City of San Antonio



Minutes

Audit and Accountability Committee

Wednesday, February 23, 2022

2:00 PM

Municipal Plaza Building

Members Present: Clayton Perry, *Chair*
Jalen McKee-Rodriguez, *Member*
Manny Pelaez, *Member*

Members Absent: Judy Treviño, *Citizen Member*

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the December 6, 2021 Audit and Accountability Meeting

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve the minutes of the Audit and Accountability Council Committee meeting on December 6, 2022. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

Public Comments

None.

CONSENT AGENDA

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Items

2. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Aviation Department with Pressure Washing Services in the estimated total value of \$2,100,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew. [Jeff Coyle, Assistant City Manager; Jesus Saenz, Director of Airports, Aviation]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

3. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one annual contract for Media, Cataloging, and Digital Processing Services at the San Antonio Public Library in the estimated total value of \$15,000,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Ramiro S. Salazar, Library Director, San Antonio Public Library]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

4. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one annual contract for Landscaping Services at the San Antonio Public Library locations for an estimated total value of \$1,700,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Ramiro S. Salazar, Library Director, San Antonio Public Library]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

5. **Briefing on the release of solicitation for one annual contract for Tree Planting and Care Services for an estimated total value of \$4,000,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Homer Garcia III, Director, Parks & Recreation]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

6. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide Event Attendant Services & Supplemental Event Security Services for the Convention & Sports Facilities Department in the estimated total value of \$6,500,000.00 for a 3-year term with 2, 1-year renewal options.** [Alejandra Lopez, Assistant City Manager; Patricia Muzquiz Cantor, Executive Director, Convention & Sports Facilities]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

7. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Public Works Department with professional asset management services for Pavement Condition Assessment of the City's Street Network for an estimated total value of \$1,100,000.00 for a 1-year contract with a 1, 1- year option to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-

Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

Post-Solicitation High Profile Items

- 8. Approval to proceed with scheduling five contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department with on-call landscape architectural services in the estimated total value of \$8,000,000.00 for an initial 1-year term with 3, 1-year options to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

- 9. Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Convention & Sports Facilities Department with an Annual Contract for Custodial and Supplemental Conversion/Labor Services at the Alamodome in the estimated total value of \$5,500,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1 year options to renew.** [Alejandra Lopez, Assistant City Manager; Patricia Muzquiz Cantor, Executive Director, Convention & Sports Facilities]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

- 10. Approval to proceed with scheduling three contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Parks and Recreation Department with an Annual Contract for Citywide On-Call Electrical Maintenance and Repairs in the estimated total value of \$2,400,000.00 for 2 years with 3, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Homer Garcia, III, Director, Parks and Recreation]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

Final Internal Audit Report

- 11. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-019 of the Finance Department and Information Technology Services Department's Payment Card Industry Security (PCI DSS)** [Kevin Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-

Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

12. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-026 of the Public Works Department Broadway Project [Kevin Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

13. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-026 of the Public Works Department's Capital Project Overhead Cost Allocation Model [Kevin Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

14. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-010 of the Department of Human Services' Delegate Agencies Contract Monitoring [Kevin Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

15. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Solid Waste Management Department with collection, characterization, packaging, transportation, recycling, and disposal of household hazardous waste services in the estimated total value of \$9,500,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew. [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; David Newman, Director]

Director of Solid Waste David Newman provided an overview of the scope and solicitation for Household Hazardous Waste (HHW) Disposal. Newman outlined the outreach methods, evaluation process and scoring criteria, listed the evaluation panel, and provided a project timeline.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry asked whether the maximum available points were being applied for SBEDA. Michael

Sindon, Economic Development Administrator noted that 20 points were the maximum available and the Goal Setting Committee applied 10 points which only were awarded to San Antonio Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA) certified small businesses. Sindon explained the Disparity Study process that provides the legal justification for the SBEDA program.

Chair Perry suggested that the solicitation should be advertised for at least 45 days, but 60 days was preferred.

- 16. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Public Works Department with construction of street improvement services related to the South Alamo Street (Market Street to East Cesar E. Chavez Boulevard), a 2017 Bond Program project for an estimated total value of \$15,400,000.00; and a recommendation to lower weighting of the price criteria for Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals for civil work projects.**
[Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Director of Public Works, Razi Hosseini provided a briefing on the project scope, funding amount and sources, and contract terms. Hosseini outlined the outreach methods, evaluation process and scoring criteria, listed the evaluation panel, and provided a project timeline. Hosseini outlined Legislative changes effective September 1, 2021 pursuant to House Bill (HB) 2581.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry requested a comparison of the SBEDA points for Item 15 versus Item 16 which Sindon provided. Chair Perry requested data on performance of the vendors in the Central Vendor's Database. Hosseini noted that Public Works had an evaluation process for their contractors but that there had been performance issues with contractors of all sizes. Ana Bradshaw explained that the Disparity study would not evaluate quality, but rather, availability of vendors who were ready, willing and able to provide the services. Chair Perry asked if the Disparity Study would review quality. Chair Perry requested more time for the bid to be advertised. Hosseini said that if the vendors requested more time the Department would extend by 2 weeks.

- 17. Briefing on the release of a solicitation to provide the Neighborhood and Housing Services Department with program delivery for rehabilitation and/or reconstruction of various residential properties funded by the City of San Antonio Community Development Block Grant Program in the total value of \$3,000,000.00 for an initial term of 1 year with up to 2, 1-year renewal options.**[Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Veronica R. Soto, Director, Neighborhood and Housing Services Department]

Director of Neighborhood and Housing Services Veronica Soto provided an overview of the scope of the Request for Proposals (RFP) which sought a vendor to determine participant eligibility, develop the home rehab scope, procure the contractors and monitor the work. Soto outlined the outreach methods, evaluation process and scoring criteria, listed the evaluation panel, and provided a project timeline. Soto further stated that the program was partially funded by the Federal Government, so SBEDA did not apply but Veteran's Owned Businesses could be provided preference points.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry asked why only 5 points were allotted for Veteran Owned Businesses. Deputy Chief Financial Officer, Troy Elliot replied that the City's ordinance only allowed for 5 points. Chair Perry requested clarification on the scope and what role staff played in oversight of the program. Soto explained the difference between the administration of the two programs, one that is managed by the Department and the other one that was outsourced to non-profits. Chair Perry asked for further clarification in a separate briefing. Soto noted that this was the first time the department issued a solicitation for a 3 year contract.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 18. Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Information Technology Services Department with Citywide Security Officer Services in the estimated total value of \$47,000,000.00 for an initial 3 year term with 2, 1-year options to renew.**[Ben Gorzell, Chief Financial Officer; Craig Hopkins, Chief Information Officer, Information Technology Services Department]

Chief Information Officer, Craig Hopkins provided background on the Pre-Solicitation Briefing made last year to the Committee on security services for the City. Hopkins described an additional review of the scope was completed in April 2021 which resulted in modifications to the scope to take into consideration recent security events at other locations nationally. Hopkins outlined the Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) outreach methods, evaluation process and scoring criteria, and a matrix of the points awarded by vendor, along with timeline or City Council approval.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry clarified that the contract was mostly dealing with manpower and physical security rather than Information Technology. Chair Perry requested clarification on the awarded SBEDA points and vendor that was deemed non-responsive due to not meeting the SBEDA Goal which Sindon provided. Chair Perry noted that 1,200 proposals received 68 had been deemed nonresponsive. Chief Financial Officer Ben Gorzell clarified that only about half of those were deemed nonresponsive due to not meeting SBEDA Goals.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez moved to Approve. Councilmember Pelaez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

- 19. Approval to proceed with scheduling fourteen contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Neighborhood and Housing Services Department with Construction Contractors for Rehabilitation of Various Residential Properties funding by the City of San Antonio HOME Investment Partnerships Program, Community Development Block Grant Program, and General Fund. These contracts have an estimated total value up to \$41,000,000.00 for a 1-year term with 3, 1-year options to renew** [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Veronica R. Soto, Director, Neighborhood and Housing Services Department]

Director of Neighborhood and Housing Services Veronica Soto provided an overview of the scope of the solicitation for the City managed Owner-Occupied Rehabilitation Program which sought construction contractors to complete the repairs and rehabilitation of qualified homes. Soto also described the Under One Roof Program that provided new energy efficient roofs for eligible homeowners. Soto outlined the outreach methods, evaluation process and scoring criteria, and a matrix of the points awarded by vendor. Soto further stated that the program was partially funded by the Federal Government, so SBEDA did not apply but Veteran's Owned Businesses could be provided preference points. Soto provided a timeline for City Council approval.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry asked why the contracts were for one year only with an option to renew an additional year and suggested that the City could get better pricing with multi-year contracts and recommended a longer term for the base timeline. Soto stated that they would investigate the opportunity for a longer contract term for the next contract period. Chair Perry asked about pricing, which Soto said the criteria was limited due to use of Federal Funding and that staff managed the negotiation of each home renovation using RS Means.

Councilmember Pelaez noted that construction pricing, particularly for materials was on the rise and while normally a longer term of contract might bring better pricing, the current economic conditions might make a shorter contract more lucrative. Soto agreed and mentioned that RS Means allowed for market fluctuations and added that the number of participating homeowners served might be adversely impacted due to higher pricing. Councilmember Pelaez suggested that Soto should bring new metrics back to City Council to re-set expectations. Councilmember Pelaez moved to approve the item.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion but requested clarification on how quality was evaluated. Soto said that all projects must be permitted and inspected by the Development Services Department (DSD). Soto added that the department investigated the participating homeowner's complaints and required the contractors to provide a one-year warranty on their work. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez requested an individual briefing on the program and contracts.

Councilmember Pelaez clarified that DSD inspections were a minimum standard and suggested there could be a higher bar set for these projects. Councilmember Pelaez recommended a longer term warranty than one-year. Soto clarified that materials such as roofing materials had longer warranties. City Attorney Andy Segovia added that the contracts required professional workmanship.

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez

Staff Briefing

20. Briefing on status of management action plans addressing audit recommendations from

prior audit reports issued. [Kevin Barthold, City Auditor]

City Auditor Kevin Barthold provided a report on status of all recommendations made by the audits performed last year.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Perry requested clarification on some of the items which was provided by Barthold.

Consideration of items for future meetings

Next scheduled meeting date tentatively scheduled for March 23, 2022.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Perry recognized Priscilla Soto for her service on the committee noting that she had resigned. Gorzell stated that staff was working on a list of potential candidates for the Audit Committee and noted that appointments were made by the Mayor.

There being no further discussion, meeting was adjourned at 3:21 PM.

Approved

Clayton H. Perry, Chairman

Respectfully Submitted

Debbie Racca-Sittre, Interim City Clerk